ABSTRACT

Eustatic estimates from the backstripping of Oligocene sections are compared quantitatively with δ18O data. Each of the nine Oligocene δ18O events (maxima) identified in previous studies correlates with a stratigraphically determined sea-level lowstand. Oxygen isotope records from planktonic foraminifers from western equatorial Atlantic Ocean Drilling Program (ODP) Site 929 indicate an isotopic increase of 0.16% per 10 m decrease in the depth of the ocean (apparent sea level, ASL). Amplitudes of ASL change also correlate with moderate- and high-resolution benthic foraminiferal δ18O records from ODP Sites 803 (western tropical Pacific) and 929 and from Deep Sea Drilling Project (DSDP) Site 522 (South Atlantic Ocean), with an isotopic change of 0.22% per 10 m of ASL change (r^2 = 0.807 and 0.960, respectively), and with records from ODP Site 689 (Southern Ocean; 0.13% per 10 m of ASL change; r^2 = 0.704). This correlation suggests that Southern Ocean deep-water temperature changes were smaller than tropical sea-surface temperature changes between million year-scale glacial and interglacial. It also suggests that the deep-sea Southern Ocean records may provide the best means to calibrate sea level to oxygen isotopes.

Keywords: eustasy, apparent sea level, oxygen isotopes, Oligocene, New Jersey, calibration.

INTRODUCTION

Published estimates of pre-Quaternary eustatic amplitudes have been obtained primarily from (1) an assessment of stratal geometry at passive continental margins and other marine basins (seismic and sequence stratigraphy; e.g., Haq et al., 1987), and (2) oxygen isotopic data, assuming the Pleistocene δ18O calibration of 0.11% increase per 10 m sea-level fall for implied ice-volume–related changes in sea level (e.g., Miller et al., 1991; Abreu and Anderson, 1998). The main difficulties with the sequence stratigraphic approach are the commonly unwarranted assumption of tectonic stability and the difficulty inherent in obtaining quantitative estimates of eustasy from inferred changes in coastal onlap (Christie-Blick et al., 1990). The main uncertainties with the isotopic approach are twofold. First, it does not reflect eustatic changes that are unrelated to changes in continental ice volume (e.g., tectonoeustasy). Second, it records both temperature (0.22%/°C increase for a 1 °C decrease) and ice-volume changes and, in the absence of rigorous independent constraints on eustatic amplitude, there has been no way to assess whether the Pleistocene isotopic-eustatic calibration is appropriate for the pre-Pleistocene. Studies using Mg/Ca ratios have begun to provide estimates of bottom-water temperature, permitting the isotopic proxy for continental ice volume to be evaluated for the Paleogene and Neogene with 500 k.y. resolution (e.g., Lear et al., 2000).

Recent studies of Oligocene strata at the New Jersey continental margin have yielded estimates of eustatic change during the early development of the late Cenozoic icehouse world (34.2–23.6 Ma) that are sufficiently precise with respect to both timing and amplitude to permit comparison with the deep-sea δ18O record. The principal novations in this research were (1) to make use of Sr isotope chemostratigraphy within an integrated chronostratigraphic framework to date a series of offlapping sequences with an absolute precision of ±0.3 to ±0.7 m.y. and relative precision as good as ±0.1 m.y. (see Pekar et al., 2000; Kominz and Pekar, 2001, for a discussion of dating and age uncertainties); (2) to quantify paleowater-depth changes in a transect of boreholes using a combination of benthic foraminiferal biofacies analysis and two-dimensional backstripping (Pekar and Kominz, 2001); and (3) to estimate eustatic amplitudes using two-dimensional backstripping (Kominz and Pekar, 2001). This paper presents the first calibration for the Oligocene of sea-level amplitudes derived from backstripping with δ18O changes in benthic and planktonic foraminifers. This result permits ice-volume effects (i.e., sea-level changes) to be removed from benthic foraminiferal isotopic records to solve for changes in water temperature associated with the same isotopic events at Southern Ocean, mid-latitude, and equatorial sites and from western equatorial planktonic foraminiferal δ18O records.

EUSTASY VERSUS APPARENT SEA-LEVEL CHANGE

In comparing stratigraphic and oxygen isotope records, the distinction between eustasy and apparent sea-level (ASL) change (defined here) is useful. Eustasy is the change in sea level with respect to a reference frame that is fixed relative to the center of Earth, and is due to variations in the volume of Earth’s ocean water and in the hypsometry of the ocean basins. As sea level either rises or falls eustatically, flooded portions of the crust undergo water loading or unloading, so that observed fluctuations in water depth relative to the ocean floor (here termed apparent sea-level changes) exceed the eustatic changes that were responsible (by a factor of ~1.48; Kominz and Pekar, 2001). Changes in ASL are solely of eustatic origin, but they differ in amplitude because their reference frame is different. The concept of ASL change also differs from that of water-depth change at passive continental margins and other sedimentary basins, because water depth at such locations is influenced by sediment accumulation and by subsidence unrelated to changes in water loading. The concept of relative sea-level change is avoided herein because, as widely used in the stratigraphic literature, it implicitly includes the effects of sediment loading (e.g., Posamentier et al., 1988).

The sea-level changes observed at small islands in the ocean are ASL changes because the crust that underlies such islands is regionally loaded by water. The ice-volume–related changes in sea level obtained from such locations for calibration against oxygen isotope records (e.g., Barbadoss; Fairbanks, 1989) need to be multiplied by 0.68 to obtain eustatic changes. (Full isostatic compensation is assumed for time scales >10^4 yr on the basis of Holocene patterns of continental postglacial rebound. The degree to which oceanic islands respond to water loading and unloading at shorter time scales is unclear.) Similarly, eustatic estimates derived from backstripping the Oligocene of the New Jersey margin must be multiplied by 1.48 to obtain ASL changes for comparison with ice-volume variations and global oxygen isotope records.
The stratigraphic record of Oligocene eustasy is well constrained at the New Jersey margin. The Oligocene sea level is defined at 61 control points between 34.2 Ma and 23.6 Ma (Fig. 1; Kominz and Pekar, 2001), with an average spacing between points of 174 k.y. and a range of 100–700 k.y. (The latter corresponds to the 95% confidence level, Miller et al., 1998). Further studies are needed to address details for these time intervals. However, the general agreement between isotopic and stratigraphic records suggests that eustatic estimates from the New Jersey margin are robust, and that simplifying assumptions about the pattern of tectonic subsidence are reasonable.

Correlation between deep-sea δ18O amplitudes and ASL amplitudes is good to excellent for moderate- and high-resolution records at 25.9 Ma as well as ca. 29.0 Ma).

The overall shapes of the eustatic and isotopic records appear to track closely between 34 and 25 Ma. However, ca. 25 Ma, a rapid lowering and rise in the sea-level record is observed without a corresponding significant increase in δ18O values. Divergence between the two records may be due to the temperature dependence of the isotopic data or to uncertainties in correlation. For example, between 25.5 and 23.9 Ma, δ18O values are consistently high (>2.0%), and by covariance between benthic and tropical planktonic δ18O records (Miller et al., 1991). Taken together, these data indicate the presence of continental ice sheets (e.g., Miller et al., 1991). In addition, between 29.9 and 28.5 Ma, δ18O values are consistently high (>1.8%), and there are several peaks above 2.2% (Fig. 1), suggesting possible additional minor sea-level oscillations (e.g., at 29.5 Ma as well as ca. 29.0 Ma).

The stratigraphic record of Oligocene eustasy at the New Jersey margin is defined at 61 control points between 34.2 Ma and 23.6 Ma (Fig. 1; Kominz and Pekar, 2001), with an average spacing between points of 174 k.y. and a range of 100–700 k.y. (The latter corresponds to the 95% confidence level, Miller et al., 1998). Further studies are needed to address details for these time intervals. However, the general agreement between isotopic and stratigraphic records suggests that eustatic estimates from the New Jersey margin are robust, and that simplifying assumptions about the pattern of tectonic subsidence are reasonable.

Correlation between deep-sea δ18O amplitudes and ASL amplitudes is good to excellent for moderate- and high-resolution records at
western tropical Pacific and Atlantic Ocean Sites 803 and 929 ($r^2 = 0.807$), mid-latitude Site 522 ($r^2 = 0.960$), and Southern Ocean Site 689 ($r^2 = 0.704$) (Table 1; Fig. 2). This correlation suggests that although benthic foraminiferal records are assumed to contain a significant bottom-water temperature signal, lowering of temperature results in a nearly linear increase in ice-volume estimates. The benthic foraminiferal $\delta^{18}O$ change per 10 m of ASL change ranges from 0.13% at Southern Ocean Site 689 to 0.22% at mid-latitude and equatorial Sites 522, 803, and 929 (Fig. 2).

High-resolution planktonic foraminiferal $\delta^{18}O$ records of western equatorial Atlantic Site 929 (Paul et al., 2000) encompass one of the largest eustatic lowerings identified by Kominz and Pekar (2001), i.e., equatorial Atlantic Site 929 (Paul et al., 2000) encompass one of the maximum. Sea-level amplitudes represent difference between sea-level minimum and preceding sea-level minimum value of $\delta^{18}O$ event and preceding minimum $\delta^{18}O$ value.

### Table 1. Comparison Between Eustatic and Apparent Sea-Level Amplitudes from New Jersey and Oxygen Isotope Amplitudes from DSDP and ODP Sites

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>New Jersey</th>
<th>Site 689</th>
<th>Site 522</th>
<th>Site 929</th>
<th>Site 803</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$\delta^{18}O$ event $^\dagger$</td>
<td>Age (Ma)</td>
<td>Eustatic lowstand (m)</td>
<td>Eustatic change (m)</td>
<td>ASL change (m)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mi1</td>
<td>23.8</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OI2c</td>
<td>25.8</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OI2b</td>
<td>27.1</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OI2a</td>
<td>28.3</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unnamed</td>
<td>30.1</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OI</td>
<td>31.7</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OI1b</td>
<td>32.8</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OI1a</td>
<td>33.5</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: ASL is apparent sea level.

* Oxygen isotope amplitudes are difference between maximum value of $\delta^{18}O$ event and preceding minimum $\delta^{18}O$ value.

† Uncertain owing to low resolution.

§ Age of maximum $\delta^{18}O$ values.

Figure 2. Benthic foraminiferal oxygen isotope amplitudes from high-resolution records from Deep Sea Drilling Project Site 522 (Zachos et al., 1996; 9 k.y. resolution), and Ocean Drilling Program (ODP) Sites 689 (Thomas et al., 1995; 40 k.y. resolution) and 929 (Zachos et al., 1997), and moderately high resolution records from ODP Site 803 (Barrera et al., 1993) are compared to detrended apparent sea-level amplitudes. Oxygen isotope events and their ages are shown. Oxygen isotope amplitudes are difference between maximum value of $\delta^{18}O$ event and preceding minimum (or average minimum) $\delta^{18}O$ values. Linear regression for western equatorial Site 803 includes one data point from Site 929. Sea-level amplitudes represent difference between sea-level minimum and preceding sea-level minimum.

**DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS**

The calibration of 0.13% per 10 m ASL from Southern Ocean Site 689 is the lowest of this study and represents the minimum value for calibrating sea level to $\delta^{18}O$ values. This calibration would account for 1.04% of the 1.3% change observed for the Oi1 event (33.5 Ma) at Site 689. This calibration is further restricted by the results of Lear et al. (2000) that suggest that deep-water temperatures changed by no more than 1 °C for the Oi1 event. A 1 °C change would account for the remainder of the isotopic excursion. The maximum uncertainties in apparent sea-level amplitudes for the Oi1 event and the possible variability in deep-water temperature between million year-scale glacial and interglacial intervals result in a calibration range of 0.10%–0.13% per 10 m ASL change for the Oligocene.

The lack of significant temperature change inferred from the Southern Ocean records implies that the rapid ice accumulation and the subsequent ice-volume changes during the Oligocene occurred without a significant decrease in source-water temperatures (i.e., polar surface waters). The lack of decreased temperatures of surface polar waters suggests that another mechanism, such as increased moisture for snow precipitation on Antarctica, may have led to ice-volume changes in Antarctica during the Oligocene. We hypothesize that the opening of the oceanic gateway between Australia and Antarctica may have increased moisture to Antarctica, resulting in higher precipitation over the Antarctic continent.

The mid-latitude to equatorial calibration of 0.22% per 10 m ASL exceeds the Southern Ocean calibration, and indicates significant bottom-water temperature changes between glacial and interglacial intervals in these regions. For example, a change from 0.09% to 0.12% per 10 m (using the calibration range from 0.10% to 0.13% per 10 m from the Southern Ocean site) would be due to non-ice-volume changes at these sites. If these changes were due to temperature alone, then a 0.41–0.54 °C change would be implied for each 10 m of ASL change for bottom waters and 41%–54% of the isotopic signal was due to temperature. These results represent a minimum value due to uncertainties in the temperature signal at Site 689. In contrast, 25%–33% of the isotopic signal in Pleistocene deep-sea records is due to temperature change (Fairbanks and Matthews, 1978), suggesting that mid- to low-latitude deep waters varied more between million year-scale glacial and in-
terglacials during the Oligocene than the thousand year-scale glacials and interglacials of the Pleistocene. Because Southern Ocean deep waters did not cool significantly during glacial periods (this study and Lear et al., 2000), non-Southern Ocean deep waters may have been cooled through increased flux of proto-Antarctic Bottom Water (as suggested by Miller, 1992).

The calibration of δ18O records from planktonic foraminifers from western equatorial sites of 0.16‰ per 10 m of ASL change is also higher than the calibration for the Southern Ocean Site 689 (0.13‰ per 10 m). These results are similar to water-temperature changes inferred from records of the LGM to present, in which tropical sea-surface temperatures (SSTs) changed by as much as 5 °C (Guilderson et al., 1994), while Southern Ocean deep-sea temperatures changed <2 °C (Birchfield, 1987). These data suggest that during the Paleogene, western tropical sea-surface temperatures may have varied more than deep-sea temperatures in the Southern Ocean between million year-scale glacial and interglacial times and that the fluctuations were greater than previously thought (Prentice and Matthews, 1991).

Our sea level/δ18O calibration also has implications for continental ice-sheet development in the Oligocene. The calibration range of 0.10‰–0.13‰ is similar to the late Pleistocene calibration by Fairbanks and Matthews (1978), and it implies an isotopic composition of Oligocene ice in Antarctica between −40‰ and −48‰, a range that is similar to isotopic values for the Greenland ice sheet at the LGM (Grootes et al., 1993). These nearly identical isotopic values are surprising. We infer the processes controlling moisture transport to ice sheets at mid-latitudes (50°–70°) during late Pleistocene glacial intervals may have been similar to those operative at high latitudes (70°–90°) during the Oligocene.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This research was supported by National Science Foundation (NSF) grants OCE-99-11121 to N. Christie-Blick and S.F. Pekar; EAR-94-17108, EAR-97-08664, and EAR-99-09179 to K.G. Miller; EAR-95-06572, HRD-96-26177, and EAR-98-14025 to M.A. Kominz, and by the New Jersey Geological Survey. Cores were obtained by the New Jersey Coastal Plain Drilling Project (Ocean Drilling Program Legs 150X and 174AX), supported by the NSF Continental Dynamics and Ocean Drilling Programs and the New Jersey Geological Survey. We thank J.D. Wright for discussions and assistance, E. Thomas for isotopic data from Site 689, and D. Sahagian, T. Bralower, and an anonymous reviewer for their insightful comments. Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory Contribution 6350.

REFERENCES CITED


Manuscript received March 15, 2002
Revised manuscript received June 17, 2002
Manuscript accepted June 20, 2002.

Printed in USA