Benthic foraminiferal B/Ca ratios reflect
deep water carbonate saturation state

Jimin Yu *, Henry Elderfield

The Godwin Laboratory for Palaeoclimate Research, Department of Earth Sciences, University of Cambridge,
Downing Street, Cambridge, CB2 3EQ, UK

Received 24 November 2006; received in revised form 13 March 2007; accepted 14 March 2007
Available online 21 March 2007
Editor: M.L. Delaney

Abstract

Boron/calcium ratios were measured in four benthic foraminiferal species (three calcitic: Cibicidoides wuellerstorfi, Cibicidoides mundulus, and Uvigerina spp., and one aragonitic: Hoeglundina elegans) from 108 core-top samples located globally. Comparison of coexisting species shows: B/Ca of C. wuellerstorfi > C. mundulus > H. elegans > Uvigerina spp., suggestive of strong “vital effects” on benthic foraminiferal B/Ca. A dissolution effect on benthic B/Ca is not observed. Core-top data show large intra-species variations (50–130 µmol/mol) in B/Ca. Within a single species, benthic foraminiferal B/Ca show a simple linear correlation with deep water ∆[CO$_3^{2-}$], providing a proxy for past deep water [CO$_3^{2-}$] reconstructions. Empirical sensitivities of ∆[CO$_3^{2-}$] on B/Ca have been established to be 1.14±0.048 and 0.69±0.072 µmol/mol per µmol/kg for C. wuellerstorfi and C. mundulus, respectively. The uncertainties associated with reconstructing bottom water ∆[CO$_3^{2-}$] using B/Ca in C. wuellerstorfi and C. mundulus are about ±10 µmol/kg. A preliminary application shows that the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM) B/Ca ratios were increased by 12% at 1–2 km and decreased by 12% at 3.5–4.0 km relative to Holocene values in the North Atlantic Ocean. This implies that the LGM [CO$_3^{2-}$] was higher by ~25–30 µmol/kg at intermediate depths and lower by ~20 µmol/kg in deeper waters, consistent with glacial water mass reorganization in the North Atlantic Ocean inferred from other paleochemical proxies.

© 2007 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

Keywords: boron; carbonate ion concentration; benthic foraminifera; proxy

1. Introduction

Measurements on ice cores show that the concentration of carbon dioxide ($p$CO$_2$) in the atmosphere was 80–100 ppmv lower during ice ages than it was at pre-industrial times [1]. In order to accurately predict the consequences of man-made CO$_2$ on future climate it is essential to understand mechanisms causing the change in atmospheric $p$CO$_2$ on glacial–interglacial timescales.

The ocean is the largest component of the climate system, and marine processes that alter the inventory or distribution of total dissolved inorganic carbon and alkalinity in the oceans are primary potential drivers of atmospheric $p$CO$_2$ change on the timescales of glacial/interglacial transitions [2]. Various hypotheses have been suggested to explain the observed atmospheric $p$CO$_2$ cycles (e.g., [3–7]), but no consensus has emerged on the specific driver(s) of glacial/interglacial $p$CO$_2$ changes. Proxies of oceanic carbonate system parameters are required to provide constraints necessary to evaluate the different mechanisms proposed to
account for atmospheric \( p\text{CO}_2 \) fluctuations. For example, reconstructions of deep water pH and carbonate ion concentrations, \([\text{CO}_3^{2−}]\), would provide insights to understand the role of changes in the ratio of organic carbon to \( \text{CaCO}_3 \) in particulate matter exported from the surface to the deep sea [8,9], the effect of vertical nutrient fractionation [4], and the mechanisms of carbonate compensation at glacial/interglacial transitions [3,5,9].

Different approaches have been developed to study changes in past deep ocean \([\text{CO}_3^{2−}]\). In general, available methods can be classified into three categories: carbonate dissolution based proxies, theory based proxies, and empirical relationship based proxies (Table 1). Many studies have been carried out to investigate how deep water pH and \([\text{CO}_3^{2−}]\) differed during glacial time [10–17,6], but changes in deep water \([\text{CO}_3^{2−}]\) remain uncertain [18]. Conflicting results for deep water \([\text{CO}_3^{2−}]\) during the last glacial interval are probably due to limitations and uncertainties in the assumptions underlying different methods (Table 1). For example, carbonate dissolution based proxies are limited to water masses close to the lysocline and suffer the complication that dissolution occurs mainly in sediment pore waters rather than on the sea floor [19,20].

The importance of deep ocean carbonate chemistry warrants the use of additional proxies to resolve conflicts of past deep water \([\text{CO}_3^{2−}]\). In this study, we have developed a novel method to reconstruct deep water \([\text{CO}_3^{2−}]\) using boron/calcium ratios in benthic foraminifera. A core top calibration approach was adopted to investigate the feasibility of using B/Ca as a proxy for the deep water \( \text{CO}_2 \) system. We then compared B/Ca ratios with other geochemical proxies from Holocene and Last Glacial Maximum (LGM) time slices in the North Atlantic Ocean to assess the reliability of this approach for reconstruction of deep water \([\text{CO}_3^{2−}]\).

### Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Proxy</th>
<th>Changes in deep water ([\text{CO}_3^{2−}])</th>
<th>Complications/limitations</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dissolution based</td>
<td>( \text{CaCO}_3 ) MAR (^b)</td>
<td>Higher in the deep Pacific and lower in the deep Atlantic and ( \text{CaCO}_3 ) % and the Southern Ocean</td>
<td>Surface water productivity, pore water dissolution</td>
<td>[1–11]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Foraminiferal shell weight</td>
<td>Consistent with ( \text{CaCO}_3 ) MAR and ( \text{CaCO}_3 ) % and further suggest large vertical gradients in ([\text{CO}_3^{2−}]) in the glacial equatorial Atlantic and Pacific</td>
<td>Pore water dissolution, variation in initial weight</td>
<td>[1,4,12–15]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Normalized shell weight</td>
<td>About 20 ( \mu \text{mol/kg} ) lower in the N. Atlantic at (~4 \text{ km} )</td>
<td>Pore water dissolution</td>
<td>[1,4,12,15]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Foraminiferal assemblage</td>
<td>About 20 ( \mu \text{mol/kg} ) decrease at intermediate depth in the western Atlantic and negligible change in other oceans</td>
<td>Surface temperature, pore water dissolution</td>
<td>[1,4,17]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>( \Delta(\text{Mg/Ca})_{\text{planktonic}} )</td>
<td>Lower ([\text{CO}_3^{2−}]) at (&gt;2.8 \text{ km} ) in western tropical Atlantic</td>
<td>Pore water dissolution, initial Mg/Ca ratio</td>
<td>[1,4,18]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theory based</td>
<td>( \delta^{11} \text{B} )</td>
<td>About 100 ( \mu \text{mol/kg} ) increase in the whole ocean</td>
<td>( pK_a ), species-dependent “vital effects” on ( \delta^{11} \text{B} )</td>
<td>[19–22]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empirical relationship</td>
<td>( D_{\text{Zn}} ) and ( D_{\text{Cd}} )</td>
<td>About 10–15 ( \mu \text{mol/kg} ) lower in the deep N. Atlantic and (~10 \mu \text{mol/kg} ) lower in the deep tropical Pacific with a (~25–30 \mu \text{mol/kg} ) peak at Termination I</td>
<td>Seawater ([\text{Cd}] ) and ([\text{Zn}] ), insensitivity at high ( \Delta(\text{CO}_3^{2−}) )</td>
<td>[23–25]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>based</td>
<td>( \Delta(\text{Mg/Ca})_{\text{benthic}} )</td>
<td>About 50 ( \mu \text{mol/kg} ) higher at 2 km in the N. Atlantic and (~10 \mu \text{mol/kg} ) higher at 3.3 km in the S. Pacific</td>
<td>Temperature effect on Mg/Ca</td>
<td>[26,27]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B/Ca</td>
<td></td>
<td>About 25–30 ( \mu \text{mol/kg} ) higher at 1–2 km and (~20 \mu \text{mol/kg} ) lower at 3.5 km in the N. Atlantic</td>
<td>This study</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^a\)Comparison of the LGM value with the late Holocene; \(^b\)Mass Accumulation Rate; \(^c\)Reference: [1]: Archer [19], [2]: Coxall et al. [13, [3]: Crowley [64], [4]: Emerson and Bender [20], [5]: Farrell and Prell [14], [6]: Farrell and Prell [15], [7]: Howard and Prell [16], [8]: Karlin et al. [66], [9]: Le and Shackleton [67], [10]: Stephens and Kadko [68], [11]: Wu et al. [69], [12]: Barker and Elderfield [62], [13]: Broecker and Clark [12,70], [14]: de Villiers [71], [15]: Lohmann [72], [16]: Barker et al. [11, [17]: Anderson and Archer [10, [18]: Fehrenbacher et al. [63], [19]: Byrne et al. [73], [20]: Kakihana and Kotaka [74], [21]: Pagani et al. [75, [22]: Sanyal et al. [6], [23]: Marchitto et al. [41], [24]: Marchitto et al. [17, [25]: Marchitto et al. [65], [26]: Elderfield et al. [31], [27]: Rosenthal et al. [42].
2. Samples and method

2.1. Samples

We measured B/Ca ratios in three calcitic (Cibicidoides wuellerstorfi, Cibicidoides mundulans (kullenbergi), and Uvigerina spp.) and one aragonitic (Hoeglundina elegans) benthic species in 108 Holocene sediments from the world’s oceans with large data sets for C. wuellerstorfi from the Norwegian Sea, the Atlantic, Indian, and Pacific Oceans (Fig. A1 and Table A1). Sediments were verified to be Holocene in age using published benthic and planktonic foraminiferal δ18O and radiocarbon dates. Several sites from the Indian Ocean only have a few centimeters (~15 cm) of Holocene sediments but omission of these data does not alter the general conclusions of this study.

Down core B/Ca ratios were measured in C. wuellerstorfi from BOFS (Biogeochemical Ocean Flux Study) 14K (58.6°N, 19.4°W, 1756 m), 5K (50.7°N, 21.9°W, 3547 m) and 8K (52.5°N, 22.1°W, 4045 m) and in C. mundulans from BOFS 17K (58.0°N, 16.5°W, 1150 m). The chronologies of these cores are from Barker et al. [11] and Manighetti et al. [21].

2.2. Analytical methods

For most of core-top samples, approximately 10–15 tests (~250 μg) were hand-picked from the 250–500 μm size fraction and cleaned by the “Cd-cleaning” procedure [22]. The effect of different cleaning methods on B/Ca was tested using large samples. About 0.7 mg of shells (250–500 μm) for each sample were gently crushed and mixed with the aim of homogenizing them as much as possible. The samples were each split into two subsamples which were respectively subject to the “Mg-cleaning” [23] and “Cd-cleaning” [22] methods. The “Cd-cleaning” procedure includes a reductive cleaning step in order to remove possible oxide coatings cemented onto foraminiferal shells [22]. When larger sample sizes were available, up to 6 sub-samples of foraminiferal shells were crushed separately (not combined after crushing) in order to investigate the natural variability of B/Ca within a single sample. In addition, Rose Bengal dyed and non-stained foraminiferal shells from eight samples were analyzed to detect possible post-mortem influences on B/Ca ratios. Foraminiferal shells from BOFS 17K, 5K and 8K were cleaned by the “Cd-cleaning” procedure [22], while shells from BOFS 14K were cleaned by the “Mg-cleaning” method [23].

B/Ca ratios were analyzed by inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometer (ICP-MS) according to the method described in [24]. On ICP-MS, the B blank is <2% of the consistency standards (B/Ca = 150 μmol/mol). When possible, duplicate measurements on the same solution were made for some core-top samples (Table A2). Based on replicate analyses of standards and samples, the precisions are <2.3% (RSD) for B/Ca. δ13C in Cibicidoides genera from BOFS 5K and C. wuellerstorfi from BOFS 14K were determined by gas source mass spectrometry. The precision is <0.08‰ (absolute error) for δ13C.

2.3. Hydrographic data

We estimated total dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC), total alkalinity (ALK), together with nutrient levels (PO4 and SiO2), salinity (S), bottom water temperature (BWT), and anthropogenic CO2 from nearby Global Ocean Data Analysis Project (GLODAP) sites [25]. The anthropogenic CO2 contribution was subtracted from DIC and pre-industrial values including bottom water [B(OH)4]/[HCO3], [CO3^2-], pH (total scale), and the saturation states (Ω) for calcite and aragonite were calculated using CO2sys. xls (Ver. 12) [26] with K1 and K2 according to Mehrbach et al. [27] and KSO4 according to Dickson [28] (Table A1). Assuming constant [Ca^2+], in seawater, [CO3^2-] is calculated by [CO3^2-]/Ω. The degree of carbonate saturation, Δ[CO3^2-], is defined as the difference between [CO3^2-] and [CO3^2-]sat Δ[CO3^2-] = [CO3^2-]−[CO3^2-]sat. When calculating Δ[CO3^2-], [CO3^2-]sat of aragonite was used for H. elegans and [CO3^2-]sat of calcite was used for other calcitic species. Seawater total boron concentration was calculated from S by [B]total (μmol/kg) = 416*S/35 [29].

3. Core-top results

3.1. Comparability of B/Ca

Core-top B/Ca ratios in four taxa of benthic foraminifera are presented in Table A2. We used both “Mg-cleaning” and “Cd-cleaning” methods to clean 22 C. wuellerstorfi, 14 C. mundulans, and 3 Uvigerina spp. samples (Fig. 1a). Comparison of the two cleaning methods revealed a negligible effect on B/Ca ratios. Measurements of B/Ca for Rose Bengal stained (“recently” live) and unstained (dead) C. wuellerstorfi and C. mundulans show similar ratios (Fig. 1b), suggesting that benthic B/Ca is not affected by any processes during post-mortem burial and variations of B/Ca reflect a biological precipitation effect. Because of comparable B/Ca ratios for stained and unstained specimens cleaned by different procedures, we have used average B/Ca ratios...
when replicate measurements were made for the same sample (Table A2).

3.2. Variability of B/Ca

Duplicate measurements of B/Ca allow investigation of natural B/Ca variability within a single sample. Standard deviations (SD) of B/Ca for C. wuellerstorfi, C. mundulus and Uvigerina spp. show a range of 0–14 μmol/mol with an average of ~5 μmol/mol (Fig. 1c). The average SD is larger than the analytical uncertainty of ~3 μmol/mol and hence B/Ca differences between shells from the same sample reflect natural variations of B/Ca within a single sample. The SD depends on the number of duplicate measurements, the amount of shells used for each analysis and the application of homogenization by mixing after crushing. In this study, SD values were calculated based on 2–6 duplicate measurements using 10–15 tests for each analysis (~250 μg) from both separately picked and homogenized samples. Larger variability in B/Ca is expected if smaller sample sizes are used without a homogenization step after crushing.

Measurements of B/Ca for coexisting species within the same sample reveal large inter-species differences (Fig. 1d). C. mundulus has B/Ca ratios about 70 μmol/mol lower than C. wuellerstorfi, but the differences are not constant and tend to be smaller at lower ratios. In comparison, B/Ca ratios in Uvigerina spp. and H. elegans are much lower. It is noteworthy that low B/Ca ratios are observed in H. elegans, which is aragonitic and expected to be more compatible to host HBO₂ than calcite [30]. This suggests “vital effects” on the incorporation of boron into benthic foraminiferal carbonates. Vital effects on B/Ca are also observed for planktonic foraminifera [40].
Benthic foraminiferal B/Ca results for core-top samples also display large intra-species variations with B/Ca values of 10–60 μmol/mol in *Uvigerina* spp. and *H. elegans*, 120–170 μmol/mol in *C. mundulus*, and 130–260 μmol/mol in *C. wuellerstorfi* (Table A2). B/Ca ratios in *C. wuellerstorfi* and *C. mundulus* are higher than those in planktonic foraminifera (30–140 μmol/mol) [40,32,6], but lower than those in corals (400–600 μmol/mol) [33–35]. B/Ca ratios in *Uvigerina* spp. and *H. elegans* are similar to those measured in planktonic foraminifera [40,32,6]. Compared with the natural variability of B/Ca of ~5 μmol/mol within a single sample composed of 10–15 specimens (~250 μg), intra-species B/Ca ranges are ~10–25 times larger and suggestive of influences from the calcification environment.

4. Variation of \( K_D \)

In seawater, the proportions of the two major boron species, B(OH)\(_3\) and B(OH)\(_4^-\), vary with pH (Fig. 2a) and B(OH)\(_4^-\) is thought to be the primary species

![Fig. 2](image2.png)

**Fig. 2.** (a) Fractions of B(OH)\(_3\), B(OH)\(_4^-\), and HCO\(_3^-\) in seawater varying with pH assuming DIC=2200 μmol/kg and [B]=416 μmol/kg. (b) Variation of [B(OH)\(_4^-\)]/[HCO\(_3^-\)] ratios with seawater pH at a constant [B] (416 μmol/kg) and differing DIC. (c) Variation of [B(OH)\(_3\)]/[HCO\(_3^-\)] ratios with seawater pH at a constant DIC (2200 μmol/kg) and differing [B]. This demonstrates possible effects on fluid [B(OH)\(_3\)]/[HCO\(_3^-\)] ratios due to changes in [B] of an internal calcification reservoir associated with foraminiferal carbonates. Insets in (b) and (c) show the pH range observed in the modern deep oceans. All curves are calculated under the conditions of 1 °C and 4 km water depth.

![Fig. 3](image3.png)

**Fig. 3.** Seawater [B(OH)\(_4^-\)]/[HCO\(_3^-\)] vs. B/Ca ratios in four benthic species from the Holocene sediments around global oceans. Dashed lines represent constant \( K_D \) values calculated using Eq. (2). Five B/Ca ratios are not included due to possible B contaminations during sample preparation. See Table A2 for details.
incorporated into carbonates [36]:
\[
\text{CaCO}_3 + B(\text{OH})_4^- \rightarrow \text{Ca}(\text{HBO}_3) + \text{HCO}_3^- + \text{H}_2\text{O} \quad (1)
\]

Because of the existence of $\text{HCO}_3^-$ in Eq. (1), B/Ca ratios in CaCO$_3$ would be expected to be influenced by seawater $[\text{HCO}_3^-]$ in addition to $[B(\text{OH})_4^-]_{\text{seawater}}$. The apparent partition coefficient, $K_D$, between calcium carbonate and seawater is defined as:

\[
K_D = \frac{[\text{HBO}_3^-/\text{CO}_3^2^-]_{\text{CaCO}_3}}{[B(\text{OH})_4^-/\text{HCO}_3^-]_{\text{seawater}}} \times \frac{[\text{Ca}^2+]_{\text{CaCO}_3}}{[\text{B}/\text{Ca}]_{\text{CaCO}_3}}
\]

In Eq. (2), $\text{CO}_3^2-$ is replaced with $\text{Ca}^{2+}$ because their molar ratios are essentially unity in CaCO$_3$. The variation of $[B]_{\text{total}}$ of deep seawater is <1% for the studied cores (Table A1) and large fluctuations in $[B]_{\text{total}}$ are unexpected on glacial–interglacial timescales due to long residence time of boron in oceans [37–39]. If $K_D$ is constant or can be quantified, the theory summarized above suggests that B/Ca ratios should provide estimates of deep water $[B(\text{OH})_4^-] [\text{HCO}_3^-]$ ratios, which could be used to calculate deep water pH (Fig. 2b and c). This has been found to be the case for planktonic foraminifera for which $K_D$ varies with temperature [40]. None of the species studied plot on a line of constant $K_D$ in Fig. 3, ruling out seawater $[B(\text{OH})_4^-]/[\text{HCO}_3^-]$ as the exclusive control on benthic foraminiferal B/Ca. Among the studied species, *C. wuellerstorfi* shows the highest $K_D$ values of 0.005–0.012; *C. mundulus* shows intermediate values of 0.003–0.005; and *Uvigerina* spp. and *H. elegans* show the lowest values of 0.0005–0.003.

Fig. 4. Distributions vs. water depth of (a) B/Ca in *C. wuellerstorfi*, (b) [B(\text{OH})_4^-]/[\text{HCO}_3^-], (c) calculated $K_D$, (d) BWT, (e) pH, and (f) $\Delta[\text{CO}_3^2^-]$. Symbols as in Fig. 3.
Because the largest global coverage for *C. wuellerstorfi*, we used B/Ca ratios in this species to investigate possible controlling factors on B incorporation by comparing the variation of B/Ca with water depth for samples classified by oceanic regions with the variation of hydrographic properties (Fig. 4). *C. wuellerstorfi* B/Ca decreases almost linearly with water depth in each oceanic region (Fig. 4a). Data from the Norwegian Sea and Atlantic Ocean fall on a similar slope as do data from the Pacific Ocean, although offset by ~40 μmol/mol. The Indian Ocean data, whilst similar to those from the Pacific Ocean, show a steeper gradient in B/Ca. These distribution patterns differ from those of seawater [B(OH)₄]/[HCO₃] (Fig. 4b). As a consequence, calculated $K_D$ values show very different patterns for samples from different oceans (Fig. 4c). Above 4.3 km, $K_D$ decreases with water depth, samples from the Norwegian Sea and Atlantic Ocean showing lower values than those from the Indo-Pacific Oceans. Below 4.3 km, $K_D$ from different oceans converge, showing a roughly constant value of 0.006. This pattern of distribution of $K_D$ with water depth is distinct from that of BWT (Fig. 4d). BWT is the coldest in the Norwegian Sea, intermediate in the Indo-Pacific Oceans, and the warmest in the Atlantic Ocean. Therefore, no correlation between $K_D$ and BWT is observed (Fig. 5a), unlike the situation for planktonic foraminifera [40]. Unlike benthic $D_{zn}$ [41], there is no simple correlation between $K_D$ and deep water $\Delta[CO_3^{2-}]$ for core-top samples (Fig. 5b). It proved difficult to quantify $K_D$ using a simple relationship because no significant correlation is observed between $K_D$ and any hydrographic parameter. Core-top B/Ca data indicate that

![Diagram](image-url)
B incorporation into benthic foraminifera is different than into planktonic foraminifera [40] and $K_D$ into benthic foraminifera is affected by a combination of factors.

5. An empirical approach

As we were unable to describe the variability in benthic foraminiferal B/Ca through the quantification of $K_D$, we considered empirical relationships between B/Ca and deep water carbonate system variables. It might be intuitive to link B/Ca with deepwater pH because the proportion to the $[B]_{\text{total}}$ of B(OH)$_4^-$, the species though to be incorporated into CaCO$_3$ [36], increases with increasing seawater pH (Fig. 2a). B/Ca ratios of samples from the Norwegian Sea and Atlantic Ocean do decrease with decreasing deep water pH (Figs. 4a, e and 5c). However, this co-variation is not observed in the Indo-Pacific Oceans because B/Ca ratios decrease with increasing water depth whereas bottom water pH remains roughly constant. This indicates only a partial effect of seawater pH on benthic B/Ca. Through changing seawater [HCO$_3^-$], DIC affects seawater [B(OH)$_4^-$]/[HCO$_3^-$] (Fig. 2b) and hence perhaps foraminiferal B/Ca. Fig. 5d suggests that benthic B/Ca is only partially influenced by DIC because $C$. wuellerstorfi B/Ca from the Pacific Ocean increases with DIC, different from the trend defined by samples from other oceans. Therefore, it is also inappropriate to straightly link benthic B/Ca with DIC.

Previous core-top studies have shown that concentrations of a number of trace metals (e.g., Mg [31,42], Zn [41], Cd [17], and Li [43]) in benthic foraminifera decrease with decreasing seawater carbonate saturation state. Fig. 4a and f show a striking similarity in the distribution of B/Ca and $\Delta[\text{CO}_3^{2-}]$, both of which decrease linearly with increasing water depth and with lower values in the Indo-Pacific Oceans than the Norwegian Sea and Atlantic Ocean. When B/Ca ratios are plotted against deep water $\Delta[\text{CO}_3^{2-}]$, B/Ca ratios in four taxa of benthic foraminifera show significant and coherent correlations with deep water $\Delta[\text{CO}_3^{2-}]$. The data can be fitted using simple linear regressions (Fig. 6a and Table 2). The sensitivities of $\Delta[\text{CO}_3^{2-}]$ on B/Ca are 1.14 ± 0.048 and 0.69 ± 0.072 μmol/mol per μmol/kg for $C$. wuellerstorfi and $C$. mundulus, respectively. It appears that the sensitivities are sustained at high $\Delta[\text{CO}_3^{2-}]$ ranges (Fig. 6a), providing the potential to reconstruct $\Delta[\text{CO}_3^{2-}]$ values of waters above the

![Table 2](image-url)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Species</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>$R^2$</th>
<th>P-value</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$C$. wuellerstorfi</td>
<td>1.14 ± 0.048</td>
<td>177.1 ± 1.41</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>&lt;0.0001</td>
<td>95(3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$C$. mundulus</td>
<td>0.69 ± 0.072</td>
<td>119.1 ± 2.62</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>&lt;0.0001</td>
<td>31(1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uvigerina spp.</td>
<td>0.27 ± 0.076</td>
<td>19.4 ± 2.99</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>0.0063</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>H</em>. elegans</td>
<td>0.51 ± 0.179</td>
<td>42.4 ± 3.12</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>0.0653</td>
<td>5(1)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All species are fitted to the form of B/Ca = A * $\Delta[\text{CO}_3^{2-}]$ + B using the least square linear regression.

*Number in parentheses indicates samples possibly contaminated and not included in the regression analysis.

![Fig. 6](image-url)

Fig. 6. (a) Bottom water $\Delta[\text{CO}_3^{2-}]$ vs. B/Ca ratios in four benthic species from Holocene sediments globally. (b) Foraminiferal $\Delta[\text{CO}_3^{2-}]$ calculated from B/Ca using correlations shown in (a) vs. bottom water $\Delta[\text{CO}_3^{2-}]$ estimated from the GLODAP dataset [25]. Only values estimated from $C$. wuellerstorfi and $C$. mundulus are shown in (b). Solid lines in (a) represent linear fits for different species. In (b), the 1:1 line (solid) and the ±10 μmol/kg uncertainty envelope (dashed lines) are shown.
saturation horizon. Scatters in the regressions may be caused by analytical errors, natural variability in B/Ca, uncertainties in estimating bottom seawater $\Delta[CO_3^{2-}]$, the occasional presence of older foraminifera due to bioturbation and/or lack of latest Holocene sediment. The low $R^2$ value for *Uvigerina* spp. probably reflects its infaunal habitat, limited measurements, and analyses of B/Ca in mixed species within one genus. We found no other relationship between benthic B/Ca and hydrographic parameters. Based on 1 standard error on the regression, the uncertainties associated with reconstructing bottom water $\Delta[CO_3^{2-}]$ using B/Ca in *C. wuellerstorfi* and *C. mundulus* are about 9.0 and 10.5 $\mu$mol/kg, respectively (Fig. 6b). The significant relationship between core-top benthic foraminiferal B/Ca and seawater $\Delta[CO_3^{2-}]$ for species living in various environments in globally distributed geographic areas (pH: 7.7–8.2, temperature: $-1–7 \ ^{\circ}C$, and $\Delta[CO_3^{2-}]: -25–85 \ \mu$mol/kg) supports the core-top calibrations and provides a robust basis for reconstructing past deep water $\Delta[CO_3^{2-}]$ using benthic B/Ca.

Dissolution effects appear to overprint some metal/Ca ratios proxies from seawater values, which is more prevalent in thinner shelled planktonic foraminifera than the more physically robust benthic species [44,45]. Four lines of evidence argue against a dissolution influence on benthic B/Ca. Firstly, B/Ca ratios are not changed by dissolution in the planktonic foraminifer *Globorotalia inflata* [40]. Secondly, a negligible dissolution effect is suggested by higher $K_D$ values in the Indo-Pacific Oceans (more corrosive) than the Norwegian Sea and Atlantic Ocean (less corrosive) at similar water depth (Figs. 4c and 5b). Thirdly, B/Ca ratios for coexisting unstrained and Rose Bengal stained foraminifera show comparable values (Fig. 1b). Because these stained samples are from cores bathed in supersaturated waters (water depth: 2885–4016 m; $\Delta[CO_3^{2-}]: 11.8–34.5 \ \mu$mol/kg), the samples have experienced minimal dissolution and therefore the observed correlation between B/Ca and $\Delta[CO_3^{2-}]$ cannot be explained in terms of dissolution. Finally, for all data presented here, a dissolution effect appears unlikely because the B/Ca–$\Delta[CO_3^{2-}]$ slope does not change over the $\Delta[CO_3^{2-}]$ range of $-25–85 \ \mu$mol/kg (Fig. 6a).

### 6. Incorporation of B into benthic foraminifera

Boron isotope systematics and inorganic precipitation experiments indicate that B(OH)$_4$ is the main species incorporated into carbonate [46,47], and B/Ca in CaCO$_3$ is influenced by seawater [B(OH)$_4$/HCO$_3$] [36]. In addition, previous studies indicate that changes in the rate of calcite precipitation and crystal growth mechanisms are important controls on B incorporation into CaCO$_3$ [48,46]. The situation becomes more complex with foraminiferal CaCO$_3$ because the formation of biogenic carbonates is heavily mediated by biological processes [49–51]. Vital effects are evident for B incorporation into both planktonic and benthic foraminifera carbonates ([40] and this study).

Because the incorporation of trace elements into foraminiferal CaCO$_3$ is poorly understood [49–51], we can only speculate on some possible mechanisms for the observed relationships between benthic B/Ca and deep water $\Delta[CO_3^{2-}]$ (Fig. 6a). It is suggested that foraminiferal CaCO$_3$ is formed from an internal calcification pool rather than directly from the ambient seawater [49–51]. Due to low $K_D$ (<1) and lack of any monotonous correlation between $K_D$ and deep water $\Delta[CO_3^{2-}]$ (Fig. 5b) as observed for benthic $D_{Sa}$ [41], the Rayleigh distillation mechanism proposed by [50] does not apply to benthic B/Ca system. However, the calcification model [50] suggests that chemical compositions of foraminiferal CaCO$_3$ are affected by processes of segregation of seawater into the internal calcification reservoir in addition to seawater chemistry. Although ambient seawater [B$_{\text{total}}$] is roughly constant, [B$_{\text{total}}$] of the direct calcification media may experience large fluctuations due to biological processes during the separation of seawater into the internal calcification pool, which would significantly influence internal fluid [B(OH)$_4$/HCO$_3$] and hence carbonate B/Ca ratios (Fig. 4c). Compared with inorganic CaCO$_3$ precipitated in laboratory ($K_D=\sim0.001$) [47], $K_D$ values into *C. wuellerstorfi* and *C. mundulus* are $\sim5–10$ times higher. This might indicate that [B$_{\text{total}}$] of the internal calcification reservoir of these species is elevated during the process of incorporation of ambient seawater into the internal calcification pool. If the B enrichment factor is proportional to deep water $\Delta[CO_3^{2-}]$ and the variability of internal [B(OH)$_4$/HCO$_3$] ratios is largely controlled by changes in the internal [B$_{\text{total}}$], a correlation between benthic B/Ca ratios and ambient seawater $\Delta[CO_3^{2-}]$ would be expected. Of course, any changes in DIC (pH) of the internal reservoir would affect the internal fluid [B(OH)$_4$/HCO$_3$] (Fig. 2b) and hence carbonate B/Ca. In these cases, it requires a link between internal DIC (pH) and the ambient seawater $\Delta[CO_3^{2-}]$ in order to explain the observed B/Ca–$\Delta[CO_3^{2-}]$ relationship (Fig. 6a).

Previous core-top studies suggest that $\Delta[CO_3^{2-}]$ exerts significant effects on benthic foraminiferal Zn/Ca, Cd/Ca, Mg/Ca, and Li/Ca [31,43,41].

It is noteworthy that boron is incorporated into planktonic foraminifera by a different mechanism and
no carbonate ion effect on B/Ca is observed for planktonic foraminifera [40]. This is not surprising as different incorporation mechanisms into planktonic and benthic foraminifera have been observed for other elements such as Cd and Mg. The partition coefficient of Cd (D_Cd) into planktonic foraminifera is largely influenced by the calcification temperature [52], while a temperature influence on benthic D_Cd is not observed [53] and D_Cd into benthic foraminifera is affected by pressure or carbonate ion saturation [54,17]. In contrast to planktonic Mg/Ca which primarily reflect calcification temperature (e.g., [55–58]), a carbonate ion saturation effect is observed in benthic Mg/Ca [31,42]. The reasons are unknown and perhaps are because planktonic and benthic foraminifera respond differently (vital effects?) to seawater carbonate ion variations during the incorporation of trace elements into their shells.

K_D values into benthic foraminifera were calculated using Eq. (2) assuming that B(OH)_4^- is the only species incorporated through the formulation described by Eq. (1) [36]. However, the existence of the HBO_3^- ion is questionable [59]. An attenuated total reflectance Fourier transform infrared (ATR-FTIR) spectroscopic study indicates that both B(OH)_4^- and B(OH)_3 are adsorbed onto mineral surfaces and that their relative proportion depends on pH and mineral type [60]. If incorporation of B(OH)_3 into the CaCO_3 lattice is different from that described by Eq. (1) and/or some B(OH)_3 is incorporated, it would be inappropriately to use Eq. (2) for calculation of K_D values. The difficulty in quantifying K_D into benthic foraminifera might indicate such uncertainties as well as the strong vital effects associated with biogenic carbonates ([40] and this study). Further studies are required to investigate the mechanisms of incorporation of B into CaCO_3.

7. Application to paleoceanography

Due to the long residence time of B in the oceans [37–39], B/Ca–Δ[CO_3^2-] calibrations constructed from global core-top samples should be applicable to estimate deep water Δ[CO_3^2-] for at least the Pleistocene. Deep water [CO_3^2-] can be calculated by

\[ \Delta[CO_3^{2-}] = \Delta[CO_3^{2-}] + [CO_3^{2-}]_{sat} \] (3)

Seawater [CO_3^2-]_{sat} is influenced by S, BWT, and pressure (P) and their effects are respectively about 0.5 μmol/kg (3% change in S), 2 μmol/kg (3 °C change in BWT) and 2 μmol/kg (120 m change in P) on glacial–interglacial timescales. Influences from changes in BWT and P are offset and the overall glacial–interglacial effect on [CO_3^2-]_{sat} from S, BWT, and P is about 0.5 μmol/kg. Due to the difficulty to estimate past changes in S, BWT and P and because they exhibit insignificant effects on [CO_3^2-]_{sat}, pre-industrial [CO_3^2-]_{sat} values can be used to calculate down core [CO_3^2-] through Eq. (3).

We have applied the B/Ca method to reconstruct deep water [CO_3^2-] at intermediate and deep water depths in the North Atlantic Ocean for the late Holocene and the LGM (Tables 3a and 3b). At the intermediate depth (Table 3a), C. mundulus B/Ca from BOFS 17K (1150 m) show average values of ∼167 μmol/mol at late Holocene and ∼188 μmol/mol at the LGM, corresponding to a

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3a</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B/Ca and δ^13C for BOFS 17K and 14K located at intermediate depths from the North Atlantic Ocean</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Depth</th>
<th>δ^13C</th>
<th>B/Ca</th>
<th>Δ[CO_3^2-]</th>
<th>[CO_3^2-]_{sat}</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>cm</td>
<td>%o-PDB</td>
<td>μmol/mol</td>
<td>μmol/kg</td>
<td>μmol/kg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOFS 17K, 1150 m, C. mundulus</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2–3</td>
<td>1.21</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4–5</td>
<td>1.16</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6–7</td>
<td>1.21</td>
<td>169</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>1.19±0.03</td>
<td>167±2</td>
<td>69±2</td>
<td>122±2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern values^4</td>
<td></td>
<td>74</td>
<td></td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>78–79</td>
<td>1.63</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80–81</td>
<td>1.40</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>82–83</td>
<td>1.59</td>
<td>197</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>1.54±0.12</td>
<td>188±10</td>
<td>99±14</td>
<td>151±14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGM–Holocene</td>
<td>0.35±0.13</td>
<td>21±10</td>
<td>30±14</td>
<td>30±14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOFS 14K, 1756 m, C. wuellerstorfi</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2–3</td>
<td>1.12</td>
<td>235</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6–7</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td>239</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8–9</td>
<td>1.05</td>
<td>233</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>1.02±0.12</td>
<td>236±3</td>
<td>51±3</td>
<td>110±3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern values^4</td>
<td></td>
<td>58</td>
<td></td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

^1Holocene and LGM ages are according to Barker et al. [11] (BOFS 17K) and Manighetti et al. [21] (BOFS 14K); ^2δ^13C are from Bertram et al. [76] and supplemented by this study; ^3seawater [CO_3^2-] values were calculated by: [CO_3^2-] = Δ[CO_3^2-] + [CO_3^2-]_{sat}, assuming constant [CO_3^2-]_{sat} values of 52.5 μmol/kg and 59.4 μmol/kg for BOFS 17K and 14K, respectively; ^4values are estimated using the GLODAP dataset [25].
LGM-to-Holocene increase in B/Ca by \(~21 \mu mol/mol\) (12% change). In BOFS 14K (1756 m), C. wuellestorfi B/Ca at the LGM are higher than at the Holocene by \(~29 \mu mol/mol\) (12% change). Using the B/Ca–\(\Delta [CO_3^{2-}]\) sensitivity of 0.69 \(\mu mol/mol\) per \(\mu mol/kg\) for C. mundulius and 1.14 \(\mu mol/mol\) per \(\mu mol/kg\) for C. wuellestorfi (Table 2), the increases in B/Ca translate to a \(~25–30 \mu mol/kg\) increase in deep water \([CO_3^{2-}]\) (Fig. 7a and Table 3a). C. mundulius is thought sometimes to live infaunally at low \(\delta^{13}C\) (<1‰) [61]. The reliability of using this species to estimate bottom water \([CO_3^{2-}]\) at BOFS 17K is supported by the fact that (1) \(\delta^{13}C\) in this core are always >1‰ (Table 3a), under which condition C. mundulius appears unaffected by pore water chemistry [61] and (2) the reconstructed deep water \([CO_3^{2-}]\) at BOFS 17K is consistently higher than in the deeper core BOFS 14K estimated from B/Ca measured in C. wuellestorfi, which is an epifaunal species (Fig. 7a

Fig. 7. Depth profiles of (a) deep water \([CO_3^{2-}]\) reconstructed from B/Ca and (b) benthic foraminiferal \(\Delta [CO_3^{2-}]\) in the North Atlantic Ocean. In (a), the grey line represents pre-industrial \([CO_3^{2-}]\) for nearby GLODAP sites 22068 (50°N, 20°W) and 27067 (58.9°N, 18.9°W) [25]. Arrows at bottom show modern \([CO_3^{2-}]\) values for AABW and NADW. In (b), \(\delta^{13}C\) LGM are corrected by 0.32‰ to account for the global oceanic carbon reservoir change. Additional benthic \(\delta^{13}C\) data measured in Cibicidoides genera are compiled from literature [54,76–80].
and Table 3a). Compared with intermediate depths, C. wuellerstorfi B/Ca from sites BOFS 5K (3547 m) and 8K (4045 m) at the LGM were lower by about 21–22 μmol/mol (12–13% change) relative to Holocene, corresponding to ~17–19 μmol/kg decrease in deep water [CO$_3^{2-}$] (Fig. 7a and Table 3b) using the B/Ca–Δ[CO$_3^{2-}$] sensitivity of 1.14 μmol/mol per μmol/kg for this species (Fig. 6a and Table 2). Such large changes in benthic B/Ca observed in BOFS 17K, 14K, 5K and 8K cannot be explained by changes in [B]$_{total}$ variations (~3%) due to ice volume growth at glacial time. Therefore, B/Ca results suggest that deep water [CO$_3^{2-}$] at intermediate and deep water depths in the North Atlantic Ocean have experienced contrasting histories since the last glacial time.

The changes in [CO$_3^{2-}$] observed in BOFS 17K, 14K, 5K and 8K are consistent with evidence from other paleo-chemical proxies. The locations and water depth of BOFS 17K and 14K place them within the Glacial North Atlantic Intermediate Water (GNAIW), which is expected to have higher glacial [CO$_3^{2-}$] due to lower atmospheric pCO$_2$ [1] and lower nutrients (Fig. 7b). Foraminiferal shell weight measurements indicate that surface water, which may affect the underlying water masses by mixing and diffusion, had a [CO$_3^{2-}$] about 50 μmol/kg higher at the LGM than Holocene [62]. Recent benthic Mg/Ca results also suggest a higher [CO$_3^{2-}$] ~2 km water depth at the LGM in the North Atlantic Ocean [31]. Water sites at BOFS 5K and 8K is thought to have been affected by the increased contribution of Antarctic Bottom Water (AABW) at glacial times, which would be expected to lower [CO$_3^{2-}$] and elevate nutrient contents (Fig. 7). Planktonic foraminiferal Mg/Ca study suggests a lower glacial [CO$_3^{2-}$] below 2.8 km in the western tropical Atlantic, implying increased influences from glacial AABW during the last glacial time [63]. The glacial reduced carbonate preservation in the deep North Atlantic Ocean indicates a lower [CO$_3^{2-}$] during glacial time [64]. Benthic Zn/Ca [65] and the normalized shell weight [11] studies suggest that bottom water [CO$_3^{2-}$] in the North Atlantic was lower by about 10–16 μmol/kg at the LGM than today. Therefore, our B/Ca together with previous studies suggest that deep water [CO$_3^{2-}$] in the North Atlantic Ocean was strongly affected by water mass reorganization during the last glacial period.

8. Conclusions

Measurements of B/Ca in four benthic species from the global oceans reveal large inter- and intra-species variations (50–130 μmol/mol). Comparison of coexisting species indicates prominent vital effects on benthic foraminiferal B/Ca. No influence of dissolution on benthic B/Ca is observed. Core-top B/Ca results indicate that K$_y$ values into benthic foraminifera are variable but not controlled by temperature. Global benthic B/Ca data show simple linear correlations with deep water Δ[CO$_3^{2-}$], providing a quantifiable proxy for deep water [CO$_3^{2-}$] reconstructions. Preliminary application of the method suggests that deep water [CO$_3^{2-}$] was elevated by ~25–30 μmol/kg at 1–2 km and lowered by ~20 μmol/kg at 3.5–4.0 km depth during the LGM in the North Atlantic Ocean, consistent with other chemical proxies.

Acknowledgements

We thank Alex Piotrowski, Martin Palmer, and Trond Dokken for very helpful discussion. We are very grateful to Gerald Ganssen for access to foraminifera from the APNAP project. Samples from the NEAPACC project were collected with NERC funding to Nick McCave, Nick Shackleton, and H.E. We thank Heather Johnstone, Johannes Simistich, Frank Bassinot, Babette Hoogeker, and the Ocean Drilling Program (ODP) for core samples, Jason Day and Mervyn Greaves for laboratory assistance, and Linda Booth for help with foraminifera picking. Constructive comments from Editor Peggy Delaney and two anonymous reviewers are appreciated. This research was funded by the Gates Cambridge Trust, European Union 5th Framework Programme project 6C (EVK2-CT-2002-00135), NERC and the Gary Comer Foundation.

Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data associated with this article can be found, in the online version, at doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2007.03.025.

References


[64] T.J. Crowley, Calcium-carbonate preservation patterns in the central North-Atlantic during the last 150,000 years, Mar. Geol. 51 (1983) 1–14.


